Management of Green Open Spaces in the Malang City Region, Indonesia

Rio Alif Aditya Putra[1], Catur Wahyudi[2], Roos Widjajani[3]

[1,2,3] University of Merdeka Malang,

Indonesia

ABSTRACT

 Based on Malang City Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2011 concerning Regional Spatial Planning in Malang City, regulations have been regulated regarding the existence, management, and availability of green open space in Malang City as an ecological balance in the Malang City area. However, this policy has only partially influenced green open space development, especially city parks. So currently, the Malang City government is managing and revitalizing several green open spaces (RTH) areas and city parks; even though they need to be improved, such funding problems hamper them. This research uses descriptive research with a qualitative approach. The research location was carried out at the Malang City Environmental Service. The data sources are primary data and secondary data. The data collection techniques used were observation, interviews, and documentation. For data analysis techniques in this research, we use techniques from Miles and Huberman, namely data collection, data condensation, data presentation, and data verification. The research results explain that budget problems have resulted in managing green open spaces limited to maintenance activities. This can be seen from indicators in policy implementation, which include the communication factor, namely the clarity of policy orders from the city government to the implementing organization, even though there has been no form of socialization to the public. The next factor is resources in the form of limited regional income and expenditure budgets, limiting the management of green open spaces. The third factor is good cooperation and coordination between related areas and regional apparatus organizations from within and outside the organization, such as the private sector or corporate social responsibility (CSR). Fourth, the bureaucratic structure, namely the organizational structure, the appropriate division of tasks and functions, and standard operational procedures have been implemented in green open space for the environmental service.

Keywords: Bureaucratic Structure, Communication, Disposition, Green Open Space Management, Resources.

_____

1. INTRODUCTION

The rapid development of population and activity intensity in Indonesia will generally influence the intensity of business activities, such as housing, trade, services, and industry, in urban and rural areas. This requires the government to work more responsively, accountably, effectively, and efficiently. To make this happen, government administration in Indonesia applies the concept of decentralization, which is carried out by delegating some government affairs to regional governments. Currently, the government is trying to carry out development in order to overcome problems in the environmental sector. This is because the environment is one of the most critical aspects for humans in carrying out their lives. The better the quality of the environment, the higher the quality of human life will be. In line with the times marked by increasingly sophisticated technology and rapid industrialization, this does not necessarily mean that current environmental conditions are very worrying. Apart from that, problems arise regarding the increasingly declining quality of the environment, such as air, water, and soil pollution, the extinction of several species of flora and fauna, and so on. The issue of declining environmental quality has become a topic of discussion on the international stage.

Urban areas of ten called cities are the center of community activities for most people. Urban infrastructure, such as large government buildings, hospitals, markets, schools, large parks and squares, and wide paved roads, can characterize cities. The study found that adequate access to green open space can be associated with longer life expectancy, providing a refreshing place from life's stresses, better health or recovery from illness, reduced obesity, increased physical activity, broader socialization relationships, and many more. Much more. The importance of

publicly accessible green open space was also highlighted as particularly useful for those who are financially unable to meet health goals.

In Indonesia, very few cities have succeeded in implementing standardization by the RTH law. Only three cities are claimed to be able to meet the standards for green open space availability in Indonesia based on the various awards they have received. First, the City of Balikpapan has fulfilled 37.40% of the area used as green open space. The second city is the City of Surabaya, which has implemented 26% of Public Green Open Space in its total area. At the same time the third is the City of Banda Aceh, which has succeeded in implementing 20.52% of Public Green Open Space. Based on the explanation above, the creation of development is an urgency in urban spatial planning based on the availability of green open space.

Green open space in Malang City is divided into public and private green open spaces. Quoted from the Malang City Environmental Service profile, this data is data for 2021. As can be seen, the city forest is part of the public green open space with an area of 148642.79 m2; in other words, of the area of Malang City, 0.14% is an urban forest. From 2021 data, only 9.64% of public green open space can be achieved. Meanwhile, for private green open space, it is 5.67%. Suppose the total of public and private green open spaces is 15.31%. With the total results of the RTH calculation, it can be concluded that the 30% standardization of public and private RTH has not been achieved by Law No. 26 of 2007, requiring each city in its Regional Spatial Planning to have at least 30%.

Based on the data above, it can be stated that the city of Malang is showing rapid physical and functional development, so participatory, anticipatory, and strategic planning and management of green open spaces are needed, which can direct and accommodate community activities in space and time. Malang City is one of the cities in Indonesia that has not been able to meet the standard of 30% green open space from the total area of Km2, both 20% public and 10% private. Malang City only has public green open space of 20,258,581 km2 and private green open space of 6,478,632Km2 of the total area of 114,261,600 Km2 (Malang City in Figures, 2023), which means this city has public green open space of 17.73% and private green open space of 5.67% of the total area. Many factors cause the lack of green open space in Malang City, one of which is the dense population of this city. Another factor is land use. Types of land use in Malang City include residential, agricultural, industrial, office, market, and school. Malang City also has a high population density with dominant land use as residential land. The increasing demand for space certainly impacts the decline in environmental quality.

Based on the above phenomenon, research needs to be carried out. This research focuses on the availability of Malang City areas to optimize the management of green open spaces in Malang City and the inhibiting factors as well as driving forces for city green open space management efforts to optimize green space in Malang City. This research aims to describe and analyze the Management of Green Open Space (RTH) in the Malang City Area and to describe and analyze the supporting and inhibiting factors for the Management of Green Open Space (RTH) in the Malang City Area by studying the implementation of Management Policy Based on Regional Regulation No. 4 of 2011 concerning Regional Spatial Planning for 2010-2030. It is hoped that the benefits of this research can be used as a benchmark for the government and society in implementing policies and as material for review by the government and citizens regarding the implementation of green open space management policies.

2. LITERATUREREVIEW

2.1 Green Open Space

Green open space can be described as various open areas (Djordje & Sanja, 2016). One definition states that "as a companion to buildings, green open space is a natural and cultural resource, synonymous with 'unused' land and 'park and recreation areas.' Another definition states that "green open space is land and water areas with open surfaces directly facing the sky, consciously acquired or managed publicly to serve conservation and have an urban formation function in addition to providing recreational opportunities" (Marilyn, 1975). From another point of view, green open space is generally defined as a meeting place or gathering place located outside the home and workplace, which all levels of society can generally access to encourage interaction and opportunities for contact or closeness between residents.

One place that is included in public space and has many benefits is green open space (RTH). According to Hamid Shirvani (1983), green open space is used for reforestation as an element of the city, which is determined by the city space's comfort and beauty factors. Comfort factors include noise dampening, sun protection (shading), and neutralizing air. Meanwhile, the beauty factor is in the form of plant arrangement assisted by constructions to prevent erosion. Green open space arrangements also apply the principles of good design composition, beauty, and comfort. According to Law No. 26 of 2006 concerning Spatial Planning, green open space types are divided into public green open space and private green open space. Public green open space is green open space that is owned and managed by the local government and is used for the interests of society in general. Public green open spaces include city parks and cemeteries in general and green lanes along rivers, roads, and beaches. Meanwhile, private green open space is a place that is included in private open space in the form of gardens or public or private houses and buildings planted with plants. Private open spaces include home gardens, paths, office parks, etc.

The spatial planning process is a process that emphasizes three essential things, namely spatial planning, space utilization, and space utilization decisions. According to Hakim (2003), the actors involved in managing green open space are the government, including the Department of Public Works, Spatial Planning, Housing and Settlement Areas of Malang City, and the Regional Finance and Assets Agency. The following actors are the private sector, society, and the media.

2.2 Spatial Planning

Spatial planning or spatial planning focuses more on methods and approaches used by the public and private sectors to influence population distribution and spatial activities at various scales. Spatial planning can be defined as the coordination of practices and policies that affect various spatial organizations or institutions. Spatial planning is synonymous with urban planning in the United States but on a broader scale, and this term is often used in planning efforts in European countries. Disciplines that involve spatial planning include land use planning, urban planning, regional planning, transportation planning, and environmental planning.

Spatial planning is a form of spatial structure and spatial pattern. Meanwhile, spatial planning is a system of spatial planning processes, space utilization, and control of space utilization. Organizing spatial planning is an activity that includes arranging, coaching, implementing, and supervising spatial planning. Spatial planning is formed on a legal basis for the Government, regional Government, and the community, which also carries out guidance, which means efforts to improve the performance of the spatial planning room. The implementation of spatial planning has functioned as an effort to achieve spatial planning objectives through the implementation of spatial planning, space utilization, and controlling space utilization. Spatial planning is also carried out by planning and supervision. Spatial planning is a process for determining the spatial structure and patterns, including preparing and determining spatial planning plans. In contrast, spatial planning supervision is an effort to implement spatial planning by the provisions of the legislation. Controlling space utilization is an effort to create orderly spatial planning, where the spatial planning itself results from spatial planning.

Urban area spatial planning provisions have several provisions, such as plans for the provision and utilization of green open space, plans for the provision and utilization of non-green open space, and plans for the provision and utilization of infrastructure and facilities for pedestrian networks, public transportation, informal sector activities, and disaster evacuation spaces, which are needed to carry out the function of the city area as a center social services economic and regional growth center. Green open space consists of public and private green open spaces. The proportion of green open space in a city area is at least 30 percent, consisting of 20 percent public green open space and 10 percent private green open space. The distribution of public green open spaces is adjusted to the population distribution and service hierarchy by considering structural plans and spatial patterns.

3. RESEARCH METHOD

3. 1 Research design

The approach used in this research is a type of descriptive research with a qualitative approach, looking based on the focus and objectives of the research. According to Creswell (2012), qualitative research methods are methods

for exploring and understanding the meaning that several individuals or groups ascribe to social or humanitarian problems.

3. 2 Research sites

Research location is related to the researcher's place as an object in the research. At the research location, researchers can obtain valid, accurate, and truly needed data. The selection of research locations is based on ease of accessing information. With all considerations in mind, the chosen research location covers the entire area of Malang City, East Java.

3. 3 Data Types and Sources

Data sources themselves are divided into two types, namely primary and secondary data sources. Primary data was obtained through written questions using a questionnaire or verbally using the resource interview method. These sources were obtained from respondents or informants determined directly by the Malang City Environmental Service research object. Meanwhile, secondary data sources are the origin of data that can provide and inform indirectly. This data was obtained from research-related documents, books, and other reports.

3. 4 Data collection technique

In collecting data and information, researchers used the following data collection techniques: interviews, observation, and documentation. Interviews are used as a data collection technique if the researcher wants to conduct a preliminary study to find problems that must be researched and also if the researcher wants to know things from respondents in more depth and the number of respondents is small. This data collection technique is based on self-reports, or at least on knowledge and personal beliefs. Furthermore, Hadi (1986) stated that observation is a complex process, a process that is composed of various biological and psychological processes.

3. 5 Technique Analysis Data

The data analysis model that researchers use in this research is descriptive analysis. Descriptive research aims to collect facts and describe all the problems to be resolved. Data processing in this research was carried out in 4 stages, namely data collection with a general survey with social situations or with research subjects, data condensation, or data condensation, which means that the researcher compressed the data by adjusting all the data obtained without reducing or sorting the data. The next stage is presenting the data in the form of narrative text. Moreover, the final stage is data verification.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

4.1 Implementation of Green Open Space (RTH) Management Policy Based on Regional Regulation No. 4 of 2011 concerning Regional Spatial Planning for 2010-2030

The Malang City Regional Spatial Planning Plan, now referred to as regional spatial planning, is the strategic policy direction, utilization, and management of Malang City regional space. the regional spatial planning is a reference for the local government and the people of Malang City to direct the location of activities and prepare development reports related to the use of city space. At this stage, the researcher tries to present and explain the results of the research that has been carried out based on the data collected during interviews and related documents. The researcher presented the data in this research according to the focus outlined by the researcher in the research method. Referring to the research focus taken from Regional Regulations, in this presentation, there will be much discussion about the situation in the field with theoretical guidance and normative related to the management of Green Open Space.

Communication is the first variable in policy implementation. One means of expanding or disseminating information is usually called communication. Communication is an essential means of implementing a policy. The importance of communication applies not only to policy implementers but also to policymakers. Effective implementation can occur if policymakers know what they are going to do. Knowledge of what will be done can work as it should if communication runs well and smoothly. Therefore, consistent, transparent, and firm communication from top to bottom is essential to avoid multiple interpretations or different understandings from implementers. Policy decisions must be communicated precisely, accurately, and consistently. This accuracy is needed because the policy

implementer or implementer can correctly receive the information. Communication or transmission of information is needed so that decision-makers and implementers will be more consistent in implementing every policy applied to policy targets.

The better the communication, the more results it will produce. Implementation is a good one, too. However, in the distribution of communication, mistakes often occur. This is because communication goes through several levels of bureaucracy, so what is expected to be saved or distorted in the middle of the road causes the results of the communication to be revised. Two indicators of communication factors that are the focus of this research are clarity of policy socialization. In terms of clarity of policy orders, communication regarding policy orders from policymakers to policy implementers must be clear and accurate. With transparent information in policy orders, the goals can be achieved by the policy's objectives. The implementation of the city park revitalization policy issued by the Malang City Government is written in Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2011. This Regional Regulation explains the wise and efficient use of space. The Mayor of Malang, as the head of government in the Malang City area, has the authority to make regional regulations or decrees and determine the regulations that are made.

In making policies, the mayor of Malang must communicate in coordination with the policy of providing green open space areas in Malang City. The policy-making process is carried out through several stages, starting with planning, agenda, formulation, and joint discussion on the board of People's Representatives Malang City to get approval. Based on the results of interviews with the Head of the Malang City Environmental Service and the Head of the Green Open Space Division of the Environmental Service, it can be concluded that there is clarity in policy orders from policymakers to policy implementers, even though in Regional Regulation No. 4 of 2011 concerning Regional Spatial Planning for 2010-2030.Obscurity: This is clarified in Mayor Regulation 93 of 2019 concerning establishing a technical park management unit at the Environmental Service. Thus, there is communication and coordination in policy that can achieve policy objectives by what is expected.

The second communication indicator is socialization, related to the implementation of policies regarding Regional Regulation No. 4 of 2011 concerning Regional Spatial Planning; in order for management to run optimally, socialization needs to be carried out. This is due to socialization's role being important in conveying information quickly and accurately, as shown by the results of interviews conducted with the Head of the Green Open Space Planning Section of the Environmental Service and the head of UPT. Management of parks and nurseries, the Environmental Service, and residents, it can be said that discussions regarding the socialization of urban open space have never been given by the policy providers, namely the Mayor and the Environmental Service itself, especially the Green Open Space Sector as the implementer of the management policy.RoomOpen Green.

Existing resources in implementing green open space management policies include three elements—namely, human resources, infrastructure, and budget. Several indicators measure resources in policy implementation, too, including human resources, infrastructure, and budget resources. Human resources greatly influence the success and failure of policy implementation, namely, a factor from implementing the policy. Human resources must understand what to do, have enough skills and abilities to implement policies and know the people involved. Have the necessary authority to implement policies and have sufficient expertise and abilities to carry out tasks, recommendations, and orders from superiors. Even though the role of experts is inadequate, this does not constitute an obstacle for environmental service to manage Green Open Space.

Based on the interview results, the duties or orders from the city government, as stipulated in Regional Regulation No. 4 of 2011, Malang City has appointed the relevant regional apparatus organizations, namely the Malang City Environmental Service, as the implementation of this policy. Then, mayoral regulation no. 93 of 2019 concerning establishing a technical implementation unit for park management and being in charge of planning, implementing maintenance, implementing management, and implementing monitoring and evaluating the park being managed. Resources relate to the skills of implementers and the adequate availability of staff implementing a policy. As stated by Edward III in Agustino (2013: 98), one of the causes of failure in policy implementation is staff who need to be more competent in their field. Apart from human resources, there are also resources in the form of budgets and facilities. Physical facilities are needed to carry out policy implementation. The existence of competent staff who understand what must be implemented, have legal and formal authority, and are recognized by the public as policy implementers will only be effective if supporting facilities are provided. The resource aspect seen in implementing

green open space management policies in urban forests needs to be improved, specifically in city parks in Malang City. This can be seen in the need for more personnel. There are more and more parks in Malang City, which is in the process of increasing the number of green open spaces.

Based on the interviews and data obtained during the research, it can be explained that there are limited budgets owned by the Green Open Space Sector and technical implementing elements (UPT). I manage environmental service Parks and Nurseries from the Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBD). So, green open space management needs to run optimally, and city parks still need revitalization. Apart from that, parks that have been revitalized are considered less than optimal because they only pay attention to infrastructure or facilities, just a garden, like a place to sit, and so on. However, the problem of cleanliness or even lighting still needs to be resolved optimally. With limited budgets, the quality of RTH management could be more optimal, making it less efficient. However, at several points, RTH received assistance from CSR, where CSR was in the form of assistance. Then, the park officially became state property. To get help from CSR, there are two ways: regional apparatus organizations looking for it or CSR offering themselves to regional apparatus organizations or regional heads.

In disposition, the implementer's attitude can facilitate or hinder policy implementation. Edward III in Widodo (2013: 104) emphasized that the success of policy implementation is not only determined by the extent to which the policy actors know what must be done and can do it but is also determined by the ability of the policy actors to have a strong disposition towards the policy being implemented. Knowledge, deepening, and understanding of policies will give rise to acceptance, indifference, and rejection attitudes toward a policy. This attitude will give rise to a disposition in policy actors. Implementing green open space management policies in Malang City is not only carried out by the Green Open Space Division and UPT. Management of Parks and Nurseries However, in improving the management of green open spaces, the Malang City Government collaborates with the private sector and cannot be separated from the role of the community; here, the three parties are interrelated to improve the quality of green open spaces. Currently, Malang City's green open space has reached 17.73% of public green open space and will be increased to 20%, and the target of implementing Malang City Regional Regulations in 2042 has reached 30%. To achieve this target, the Environmental Service, through the Green Open Space Sector, is doing several things to improve and manage green open space, as the UPT does. Management of parks and nurseries involves replanting or replacing plants that are deemed unfit. Based on the results of the above analysis by the Environmental Service, it is also known that the disposition aspect carried out is good. This can be seen from the attitude of the implementers who responded positively and implemented the green open space policy at the UPT's sound management of parks and nurseries.

In a bureaucracy, a bureaucratic structure is needed to facilitate coordination in the distribution of responsibilities between personnel. Namely, creating a Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) is necessary. This aspect of organizational structure covers two things, namely, the mechanism and the bureaucratic structure itself. The first aspect is the mechanism; a Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) is usually created in implementing policies. SOP is a guideline for each implementer to implement the policy and not deviate from the policy goals and objectives. The second aspect is the bureaucratic structure; a bureaucratic structure that is too long and fragmented will tend to weaken supervision and lead to complicated and complex bureaucratic procedures, which in turn will cause organizational activities to become inflexible. Widodo (2013: 106) states that "Standard operating procedures (SOP) will facilitate and standardize the actions of policy implementers in carrying out their duties." Exemplary policy implementation requires an effective and efficient bureaucratic structure and performance mechanisms. This bureaucratic structure includes aspects such as organizational structure, distribution authority, relationships between units within the organization concerned, relationships with external organizations, and so on.

4.2 Factors that are Encouraging and Inhibiting the Implementation of Green Open Space (RTH) Management Policies Based on Regional Regulation No. 4 of 2011 concerning Regional Spatial Planning for 2010-2030

4.2.1 Supporting Factors

One of the things that makes the process of implementing the RTH management policy in Malang City smooth and achieves the desired goals is the supporting factors. This benefits the City Government as it is responsible for the RTH implementation activities. One of the supporting factors is the joining of the private sector (CSR) into government programs, the opportunity for the private sector (CSR) to have a vast influence where the

private sector funds programs run by the government, in other words, the private sector (CSR) funds the construction of parks in the city to increase the percentage of green open space in Malang City. Then the supporting factor also comes from park management with the revitalization carried out in several parks in Malang City aimed at realizing city infrastructure and becoming a quality city by Malang City Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2011 Article 7. So that is one form of effort. What the Malang City government has done to realize this goal is to build parks. Of course, working better requires collaboration or coordination with various related agencies or institutions.

4.2.2 Supporting Factors

The factor hampering the implementation of the green open space management policy is the increasing area of the park; there is a shortage of workers and notable experts to manage the park. If there are additional gardens every year, we need energy. Then, there are obstacles in the budget for individual land purchases. Because funds from the APBD are not fully allocated to Green Open Space, only 10%, but development is comprehensive. However, if the APBD budget does not allow the Green Open Space Sector, the Environmental Service will take the initiative by implementing a Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) program. Then, when it comes to facilities, sometimes, due to budget limitations, we experience a little difficulty in examples of procurement of goods to support the management of Green Open Space. As a result of the current increase in population in Malang City, the need for land will automatically increase. Currently, many land conversions are at the community's request to develop city infrastructure facilities. The city government, of course, utilizes this in utilizing the land to increase income native to the region. by granting government building permits to developers to build shops, malls, hotels, and even housing, which, in fact, is more economical than Green Open Space land. Korean local revenue from a tax perspective that can best support income figures is property tax compared with other tax classifications. Much green open space has been converted into parking lots, high-rise buildings, malls, etc. This requires firmness from the City Government to regulate the RTH area, which has changed its function. The inhibiting factors above influence the implementation of green open space in Malang City. Due to the many inhibiting factors that can slow down the implementation process, parties who are aware of the need for green open space, which is very important for all aspects, a relatively broad understanding of green open space is needed in Malang City, so that the process carried out is safe and well structured and most importantly the expected goals will be achieved.

5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Conclusion

Based on the results of the data obtained and the data analysis that has been carried out by researchers implementing green open space management policies in the city of Malang, it can be concluded that in communication, the Mayor of Malang has carried out coordination and communication to plan, formulate, and determine and approve policies together. However, there has yet to be any outreach to the community. At the Environmental Service and related regional apparatus organizations, coordination and communication have been carried out through internal discussions, starting from the planning, formulation, and sustainability of management, supervision, maintenance, and revitalization activities. Discussions regarding the socialization of urban green open spaces have never been given to the public by policy providers, namely the Mayor and the Environmental Service itself, especially the Green Open Space Sector, as the implementer of the Green Open Space management policy. There are several provisions for implementing RTH management activities that are not explained in detail in Regional Regulation No. 4 of 2011, such as provisions related to green open space management, particular budgets, procedures, or structures for conveying information related to management, as well as violations or sanctions if green open space management policies do not work.

Regarding resources, meeting the weaknesses of competent workers is not supported by personnel with unique abilities, such as experts in civil engineering, architecture, agriculture, geology, planning, and civil engineering each year. Due to budget constraints, management of green open spaces is limited to maintenance and construction of green open spaces. Meanwhile, park management collaborates using CSR assistance, CSR only carries out revitalization and new development in parks with strategic locations. Support from other resources to add and repair facilities and infrastructure, such as trucks, dump trucks, and water tank trucks, can support more efficient management of green open spaces.

In the management of green open spaces, the establishment of good cooperation and coordination between areas within the organization and related regional apparatus organizations, as well as from outside the organization (private parties or CSR), has resulted in the maintenance of public open space from 2010 to now amounting to 17.73%. The cooperation and coordination referred to above have not been balanced with rapid follow-up to resolve existing problems, for example, the problem of budget limitations, as well as outreach to the community regarding the management of green open spaces and the importance of maintaining parks to maintain the beauty of Malang City—organizational structure in the Green Open Space Sector, especially UPT. The management of parks and nurseries at the Environmental Service has implemented standard operating procedures (SOP). Cooperation and coordination between the organizational sector and regional apparatus organizations inside and outside the organization that supports implementing green open space management policies are carried out conditionally in coordination and discussion.

The driving factor in policy implementation is that green open space management is carried out to create city infrastructure and become a quality city per Regional Regulation No. 4 of 2011. So, one form of effort the Malang City government made to realize this goal is managing, maintaining, and revitalizing parks. The private sector's (CSR) involvement in the green open space management program in terms of constructing and maintaining several park points in Malang City as a need for parkland. This is considered very helpful in funding policy implementers. The inhibiting factor in implementing the policy is that the problem of a limited budget is an internal factor and influences the implementation of city park revitalization policies and the lack of interest from green open space visitors, and the facilities or infrastructure available in the park do not attract the interest or attention of visitors.

5.1 **Suggestion**

The implementation of the RTH management policy in Malang City still faces obstacles; for this reason, it is essential to have a solution so that the implementation of RTH management in Malang City achieves the desired goals. Therefore, the advice is to manage green open spaces optimally, focusing on air quality and physical facilities such as sports facilities, games, or benches and tables. Of the inhibiting factor, namely the lack of workers and experts in creating gardens, recruitment should immediately be done for workers and experts competent in developing green open spaces. They are starting from competence in creating gardens to managing parks in Malang City. Policy implementers are provided with increased knowledge through training, education, and technical guidance related to park revitalization and spatial planning.

REFERENCES

Agustino, (2006). Implementasi Kebijakan Publik Model Van Meter Van Hom. Bandung: AIPI Bandung.

Agustino, L (2006). Dasar-dasar kebijakan publik. Bandung: CV. Alfabeta.

Anderson, James E. (1970). Public Policy Making. New York: Reinhart and Wiston.

Allmendinger, P. (2009). Planning Theory. Millan City: Palgrave Press.

Assche, Van, dkk. 2013. Co-evolutions of Planning and Design. America: University Press of America.

Catanese, Anthony James & James C. Synder. 1989. Perencanaan Kota Edisi Kedua. Jakarta: Erlangga.

Creswell, John W. 2012. Research Design Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Mixed. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.

Creswell, John W. 2016. Research Design, Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches, Fourth Edition. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Pustaka Pelajar.

Djordje, A. & Simonovic-Alfirevic Sanja. 2016. Interpretation of Space within Space Concept in Contemporary Open-Plan Architecture. Portugal: Belgrade Press.

Edward III, G.C. (2015). Implementasi public policy, frilla Dara Wallah, analisis kesiapan pemerintah kota bandung dalam menerapkan standar akutansi pemerintah berbasis akrual, universitas pendidikan Indonesia, 75.

Feldt, Allan G. (1989). Teori Perencanaan dalam Perencanaan Kota Edisi Kedua. Jakarta: Erlangga

Gunder, M. & J. Hiller. 2009. Planning in Ten Words or Less, A Lancanian Entanglement with Spatial Planning: Ashgate Publishing, Ltd.

Hartig, T, dkk. (2003). Tracking Restoration in Natural and Urban Field Settings. Bangkok: Elsevier.

Ives, Christopher, et al. 2014. Final Report for Australian Government Department of Environment: Melbourne: RMIT University.

Miraza, Bachtiar Hassan. 2005. Peran Kebijakan Publik dalam Perencanaan Wilayah. Medan: Universitas Sumatera Utara.

Samsudi. (2010). Ruang Terbuka Hijau Kebutuhan Tata Ruang Perkotaan Surakarta. Journal of Rural Development Vol 1 No 1.

Kridhawati Shadhana, (2011). Realitas Kebijakan Publik. Malang: Universitas Negeri Malang (UM Press), 50.

Lestari, Detaatmalia. (2015). Implementasi Kebijakan Ruang Terbuka Hijau Di Kota Malang (Studi Pada Kawasan Stadion Gajayana Malang). Malang: Universitas Brawijaya.

Moleong, Lexy. 2014. Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya Offset

Corresponding Author: Roos Widjajani

University of Merdeka Malang