



The Influence of Audit Committee Activities, Audit Committee Independence, Audit Committee Competence, and Female Audit Committee Members on Audit Quality in Palm Oil Companies

David Lumban Gaol, Edi Subiyantoro, and Prihat Assih

University of Merdeka Malang

Indonesia

ABSTRACT

This study aims to analyze the effect of audit committee activities on audit quality, analyze the effect of audit committee independence on audit quality, analyze the effect of audit committee competence on audit quality, and analyze the effect of female audit committees on audit quality. The number of samples in this study was 12 companies for 6 years, namely 2018 to 2023, so that the total number of observations was 72 samples. The data analysis technique used multiple regression. The results of the analysis show that audit committee activities have a positive and significant effect on audit quality. This indicates that a more active audit committee supervises the audit process and ensures that auditors carry out their duties independently and objectively encourages auditors to carry out audits more carefully and produce quality audits. Audit committee independence has no effect on audit quality. This shows that audit committee independence cannot affect the quality of audits produced by external audits. Supervision related to audit results carried out by an independent audit committee if not balanced with competence and experience related to the related field to supervise external audit performance to produce quality audit reports. Audit committee competence has no effect on audit quality. This shows that audit committee competence cannot affect the quality of audits from external auditors. Auditors in carrying out their audits must remain in accordance with procedures and must improve their audit quality so that the audited financial statements can reflect the true value. The existence of a female audit committee does not affect audit quality. This shows that the presence of women in the audit committee does not affect the audit quality of external auditors. External auditors in carrying out the audit process are not influenced by the gender of the audit committee in carrying out the supervisory function and the audit results made by the external auditor.

Keywords: Audit Committee Activities, Audit Committee Independence, Audit Committee Competence, Female Audit Committee, Audit Quality.

1. INTRODUCTION

Mandiontong (2015:143) states that something is considered to have quality if it meets certain requirements and the features and characteristics of the product or service can meet customer expectations both in terms of marketing, engineering, production and maintenance. In relation to audits, audit quality is defined as the possibility that financial statements contain material misstatements or violations that occur in the accounting system that will be found and reported by the auditor when conducting an audit of financial statements by referring to relevant audit standards and codes of ethics (Hermawan and Damayanti, 2018:20). A quality audit of a company is expected to increase the level of trust and integrity of the financial information presented in the financial statements. A high-quality audit shows that the auditor has carried out his duties independently, objectively, and with great care.

Success in identifying potential risks and proper management in quality audit work provides confidence that the financial statements are free from material errors that can harm stakeholders. In addition, a quality audit also reflects the professionalism and ethics of the auditor, which creates a strong foundation for public and other stakeholders' trust.

A quality audit is not just an inspection process, but also a measure of a company's credibility in the eyes of the market, investors, and the wider community. A reliable audit is an important foundation for achieving financial

transparency, maintaining market fairness, and protecting the interests of all parties involved. Therefore, the importance of auditor ethics in conducting audits cannot be ignored, because integrity and compliance with ethical standards provide a solid foundation for the reliability of audit results. Auditors who comply with the code of ethics can build stakeholder trust, ensure transparency in financial reporting, and make a positive contribution to the integrity of the financial market as a whole. Therefore, auditor ethics are not only norms that must be followed, but also the main foundation that guarantees the reliability of the audit process and public trust in the financial information presented. According to Novitasari et al. (2020), one thing that can have a negative impact on the company is an unreliable audit activity that cannot detect fraud committed by the board of commissioners.

In reality, there are financial reports that are manipulated for the benefit of certain parties. Several cases of accounting violations have occurred in Indonesia. In 2021, PT Kimia Farma, which was audited by KAP Hans Tuanakotta & Mustofa (HTM), was identified as having marked up net profit so that the financial report overstated sales and inventory (Kencana, 2015). Then, in the 2001 fiscal year, PT Indofarma, which was audited by KAP Hans Tuanakotta & Mustofa (HTM), was identified as having overstated the value of goods in process by IDR 28.87 billion. As a result, the Cost of Goods Sold was understated and net profit was overstated by the same value (Amr, 2003). Then PT Asuransi Sosial Angkatan Bersenjata Republik Indonesia (Asabri) which was audited by KAP Hadori Sugiarto Adi and Partners for the 2010 financial report year, KAP Kanaka Puradiredja, Suhartono for the 2011-2013 financial years, KAP Heliantono and Partners for the 2014-2016 financial years, and KAP Tanudiredja, Wibisana, Rintis and Partners (PwC) for the 2017 financial year experienced several restatements (CNBC, 2020), the Audit Board of Indonesia (BPK) has conducted an audit of PT Asabri (Persero) since 2016 and the results found that this insurance company owned by the TNI and Polri invested a lot of funds in illiquid stock portfolios which caused losses (Wareza, 2020). PT Asuransi Jiwasraya, audited by KAP Tanudiredja, Wibisana, Rintis and Partners (PwC) in 2016-2017 experienced liquidity problems, making management unable to pay the unit link saving plan insurance policy that had matured amounting to IDR 802 billion (Sidik, 2019). In the 2018 financial year, PT Garuda Indonesia, audited by AP Kasner Sirumapea and KAP Tanubrata, Sutanto, Fahmi, Bambang and Partners (BDO), recognized revenue that was not in accordance with accounting standards, recognizing revenue of US\$ 809 thousand in the financial statements, in contrast to the 2017 condition which suffered a loss of US\$ 216.58 million (Pratiwi, 2019).

Audit quality began to gain attention with the Enron Corporation case in 2001, which was a high-level collusion between Enron management, financial analysts, legal advisors, and its auditor Arthur Andersen Hudson office, which had helped in the process of financial statement engineering (Wahyudi, 2012). Behavior that did not comply with corporate governance principles, especially in terms of integrity and accountability, contributed significantly to Enron's downfall.

Stakeholders, including investors and employees, suffer from significant loss of share value and negative impact on the company's reputation. This case certainly highlights the importance of implementing reliable audit activities in supporting sustainable financial performance and maintaining stakeholder trust. Lack of good governance can damage the financial integrity of a company and have detrimental impacts on various levels of society and financial markets.

The phenomenon that occurred at Enron Corp is an important example in implementing the activities, independence, and competence of the audit committee in conducting an audit in a company. In addition, The Greatest Showman (2019) adding that the collapse of Enron Corp also prompted policymakers to overhaul regulations related to corporate governance, namely by including gender diversity to broaden the thinking of board groups that usually only consist of men. Abbasi et al. (2020) mentioned that the government in several European countries such as Norway, Spain, and France implemented to provide at least 40% of the board quota must be filled by female gender, where non-compliance with this regulation results in sanctions such as fines paid by the company's directors. The implementation of the regulation certainly produces something new, as mentioned by the Department for Business, Innovation & Skills found that the financial reports submitted by the female board have progress in accordance with the target.

Based on this phenomenon, this study will analyze the impact of audit committee activities, audit committee independence, audit committee competence, and female audit committees on audit quality in oil palm plantation companies listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange. The selection of oil palm plantation companies as the object of research because these companies are often involved in sensitive environmental issues, such as deforestation and

impacts on biodiversity. High-quality audits are needed to ensure that financial statements accurately reflect the company's social responsibility and environmental impact. In addition, this industry faces unique risks, such as environmental risks and regulatory risks, which can be identified and managed through comprehensive audits. Good audits support accountability, transparency, and good corporate governance principles, all of which are essential to building stakeholder trust and maintaining industry sustainability.

In addition, the palm oil industry is still relied upon in the national trade balance, seen from its contribution of 13.50 percent to non-oil and gas exports and contributing 3.50 percent to Indonesia's total GDP (Directorate General of Plantations, 2022). Reported from jakartaglobe.id (April 15, 2023), statistical data shows that in February, Indonesia exported 154,500 tons of palm oil to the Netherlands, an increase from 152,900 tons in the previous month. However, there was a decline in exports to the United States, down from 207,400 tons at the beginning of the year to 127,700 tons in February. Although export volumes decreased slightly, the value of Indonesian palm oil exports increased from around \$2.61 million in January to around \$2.69 million the following month. Indonesia's total palm oil exports in January-February reached 5.86 million tons. Although there was a decrease in volume to 2.91 million tons in February, the export value continued to show an increase(Shofa, 2023).

Therefore, audit quality research in palm oil plantation companies is not only a reflection of the overall financial health of the company but also a measure of the extent to which the company understands and manages its impact on the environment and society.

2. THEORETICAL BASIS

2.1. Agency Theory

According to Jensen & Meckling (1976), an agency relationship occurs when one or more people (principals) order another person (agent) to perform a service and delegate the authority to make decisions. The principals are the shareholders and the agents are the management who carry out the decision-making function in the company. Conflicts of interest between the principal and the agent can arise because there is a possibility that the agent does not always act in accordance with the wishes of the principal, this can cause agency costs. The way that can be expected to reduce this conflict is through reports made by accountants to find out the performance of agents in carrying out their functions in the company, so that it can reduce the risk of information imbalance called information asymmetry.

2.2. Audit Quality

DeAngelo (1981) defines audit quality from two aspects, namely the auditor evaluates the client's structure and finds deficiencies in the financial statements as an auditor and to notify or disclose things that are unclear and inaccurate. Audit quality is defined as the likelihood that an auditor will find material misstatements in the client's financial statements (competence) and honestly report material errors, misrepresentations, or omissions in the client's financial statements in the auditor's audit report (independence). The agency problem that arises between owners and managers due to the asymmetry of information between them is the main motivation for conducting external audits. The external audit function plays an important role in the corporate governance system because it bridges the gap between the party that prepares financial information (management) and the party that uses it (shareholders) (Alhababsah & Yekini, 2021).

In determining audit quality, Gama and Astuti (2014) measure audit quality through the level of audit market concentration, which shows how much market share is controlled by the KAP calculated using The Herfindahl Hirschman Index (HHI), this refers to the context of audit opinion with going concern modification, special expertise is needed because the evaluation of the company's survival is predictive, so that auditors who are experts in the field are needed. Auditors with specialization and experience in a particular industry tend to provide more accurate opinions when their clients are in the same industry. In other words, Public Accounting Firms (KAP) that dominate a particular industry market will provide better audit quality for clients in that industry. Globally, the audit market share has been controlled by the four major KAPs, namely Ernst & Young, Deloitte & Touche, PricewaterhouseCoopers, and KPMG since 2004. A similar situation occurs in Indonesia, where the audit market is dominated by KAPs affiliated with the four major KAPs, indicating a high level of audit market concentration.

2.3. Audit Committee

The main basis for the establishment of an audit committee is the Decree of the Chairman of Bapepam Number: Kep-643/BL/2012 concerning the Establishment and Guidelines for the Implementation of the Work of the Audit Committee which requires the establishment of an audit committee for companies listed on the stock exchange and the formulation of the duties and responsibilities of the audit committee whose purpose is to carry out supervision in order to increase the effectiveness of transparency and quality financial reporting, compliance with applicable laws and regulations, and adequate internal supervision.

Based on the description above, it can be concluded that the Audit Committee is an independent body formed by a company or organization to help oversee and manage internal and external audit functions and internal control systems. The formation of the Audit Committee is often a response to the need to increase transparency, accountability, and integrity in the financial reporting process. The following are parts of the audit committee that are used as variables for study:

2.3.1. Audit Committee Activities

Audit committee activities are supervisory activities carried out by the audit committee on management activities in running a company. These supervisory activities are represented by the number of audit committee meetings held by the audit committee during one year (Rinta, 2021). According to Sharhan & Bora (2020), audit committee meetings are a number of sessions to consult and debate the accounting and auditing processes in an organization. As a result, they can hold meetings quarterly, semi-annually or four times a year. Undoubtedly, the size of the audit committee is increasing; the frequency of meetings with them is decreasing. This is due to the difficulty of communicating with audit committee members. the frequency of audit committee meetings is believed to improve the quality of financial reporting, resulting in better audit quality. The informal relationship that the committee has with audit stakeholders including internal and external auditors, and top management also improves audit quality in public and private.

2.3.2. Independence of the Audit Committee

Independence is a neutral attitude or non-partisanship towards one side. The independence of the audit committee is needed in its role as an effective supervisory body, members of the audit committee must be independent of management or controlling shareholders. The audit committee must consist of independent outside directors as a system to ensure the reliability and transparency of accounting information management by supervising management from an independent perspective. The independence of the audit committee is represented by the number of audit committees originating from outside the company divided by the total number of audit committees in a company. (An, 2023).

2.3.3. Audit Committee Competencies

Competence is the ability or competence of knowledge and skills possessed by a person to do a job. According to An (2023), audit committee members are responsible for management work, supervision of the financial reporting process, and the appointment and remuneration of external auditors so they must have accounting or financial knowledge. However, if audit committee members lack technical knowledge or insight into accounting or auditing, there are limits to their ability to resolve disputes between management and external auditors.

2.3.4. Women's Audit Committee

A women's audit committee is an independent body formed by a company or organization to help oversee and manage internal and external audit functions and internal control systems with members who are female. According to Mustafa et al. (2020), women on the company's board of directors are able to bring diverse perspectives and ideas to bear in board decision-making on policy. Gender diversity on the board of directors is considered important in terms of protecting the benefits of all stakeholders and can be used to improve the company's financial policies, improve the board's function and efficiency due to their diverse skills, including knowledge and other qualities. Female directors tend to be risk-averse and are less overconfident than their male counterparts on the board of directors. Women's risk-averse behavior can be lost and their role on the board can be significantly reduced if they accept male dominance on the board. Women sitting on the board increases the effectiveness and efficiency of the company because of their

hardworking nature and skills. These skills and abilities help women take necessary actions to reduce agency problems in the company. The female audit committee is represented by the number of female audit committee members divided by the number of audit committees.

2.4. Research Hypothesis

Based on the theoretical framework that has been explained above, the research hypothesis consists of:

1) The Influence of Audit Committee Activities on Audit Quality

In developing this hypothesis, previous research, as expressed by An (2023), shows that audit committee activities that are very active in holding meetings as a form of supervision tend to choose large audit firms and have low earnings management which can be interpreted as having good audit quality. Research conducted by Rinta (2020) an audit committee that actively holds meetings (meetings) can be said to be a well-structured audit committee so that it can carry out its duties and functions to minimize management in carrying out earnings management. Meetings allow audit committee members to discuss issues that are their responsibility to oversee the company's audit committee activities. However, research by Indella and Husaini (2016) shows that the frequency or number of audit committee meetings does not affect the possibility of fraudulent financial reporting. In this study, it is assumed that the more active the audit committee is in carrying out its supervisory duties, the better the quality of the audit produced. The development of this hypothesis aims to investigate the positive contribution of the level of involvement and activity of the audit committee to improving audit quality in the environment of palm oil companies on the Indonesia Stock Exchange (IDX). So that the hypothesis formed is as follows

H1 : Audit committee activities affect audit quality.

2) The Influence of Audit Committee Independence on Audit Quality

Based on previous findings, especially from Klein's (2002) research which stated that a board structure that is more independent of the CEO is more effective in monitoring the company's financial accounting process. The results of the study found that reduced audit committee independence can increase earnings management, if the practice of earnings management is lower, the quality of the audit produced is better, in contrast to An (2023) audit committee independence has no effect on audit quality, so that this hypothesis will be tested further. The development of this hypothesis involves the assumption that the independence of the audit committee can affect the audit quality of palm oil companies on the IDX, so that the hypothesis formed is as follows:

H2 : The independence of the audit committee affects audit quality.

3) Influence Audit Committee Competence on Audit Quality

This hypothesis was developed by referring to Abbasi's research (2020), which shows that the committee audit who have competence in the field of accounting expertise, expertise and supervisory expertise can improve the supervision and quality of the company's audit. In contrast to An (2023) who showed that the competence of the audit committee does not affect audit quality. The development of this hypothesis assumes that the higher the level of expertise and knowledge in the audit committee, the better the quality of the audit produced. This study will investigate the deeper relationship between audit committee competence and audit quality in palm oil companies listed on the IDX. So that the hypothesis formed is as follows:

H3 : Audit committee competence influences audit quality.

4) Influence Impact of Women Audit Committee on Audit Quality

Based on An's (2023) research which noted the positive impact of the presence of female members on the audit committee on audit quality, in line with the results of Abbasi's (2020) research that the presence of female financial experts on the audit committee can improve financial reporting supervision and audit quality. This hypothesis assumes that gender diversity, especially the presence of women on the audit committee, makes a positive contribution to improving audit quality. The development of this hypothesis will explore the important role

of gender diversity in the context of the palm oil industry on the IDX, with a focus on the effectiveness of supervision and audit quality. So that the hypothesis formed is as follows:

H4 : Female audit committees influence audit quality.

3. RESEARCH METHODS

3.1. Operational Definition of Variables

a. Audit Quality (Y)

Audit quality can be calculated through the level of audit market concentration using the following HHI formulation (Dubaere, 2008:22):

$$HHI = \frac{\sum_1^k S_i^2}{(\sum_1^k S_i)^2}$$

k = number of KAPs in the market;

Si = size of KAP i, measured using the (square root) of the client's sales (primary activity revenue).

b. Audit Committee Activities (X1)

These supervisory activities are represented by the number of audit committee meetings held by the audit committee during one year (Rinta, 2021).

c. Audit Committee Independence (X2)

Audit committee independence is a neutral attitude or impartiality to one side, independent audit committee members have no interest in management to ensure the reliability and transparency of accounting information management by supervising management from an independent perspective (An, 2023). Calculated through:

Independence of the Audit Committee: $\frac{\sum \text{Komite Audit Luar Perusahaan}}{\sum \text{Seluruh Komite Audit}} \times 100$

d. Audit Committee Competence (X3)

According to An (2023), audit committee members are responsible for management work, supervision of the financial reporting process, and the appointment and remuneration of external auditors so they must have accounting or financial knowledge. Calculated through:

Audit Committee Competencies: $\frac{\text{Anggota Komite Audit yang kompeten dalam bidang keuangan}}{\text{Jumlah keseluruhan komite audit}}$

e. Women Audit Committee (X4)

According to Mustafa et al. (2020), women on the company's board of directors are able to convey diverse perspectives and ideas in board decision-making regarding policies. Calculated through:

Women's Audit Committee: $\frac{\sum \text{komite audit perempuan}}{\sum \text{komite audit}}$

3.2. Population and Sampling Techniques

Population is a collection of elements that have certain characteristics that can be used to draw conclusions (Chandrarin, 2017:125). In this research, the population used was palm oil companies listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange in 2018-2023. A sample is a collection of subjects that represent a population (Chandrarin, 2017:125). In this study, the sampling method used is nonprobability sampling with a purposive sampling approach. The way Purposive sampling works itself involves selecting samples based on consideration of certain criteria from members of the population. The criteria used in sampling this study include:

- 1) Palm oil plantation companies listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange during the period 2018-2023.
- 2) Palm oil plantation companies that have consecutively published annual reports for the 2018-2023 period.
- 3) Palm oil plantation companies that have data related to research variables during the period 2018-2023.

Based on these criteria, the following sample selection was obtained:

Table 1. Company Sampling Techniques and Results

Information	Amount
Total Palm Oil Companies	28
Palm oil companies that did not publish their 2018-2023 annual reports to the public in full.	(12)
Companies that do not have data related to the research variables (all data is not available during the period 2018-2023)	(4)
Sample companies	12
Observation Year	6
Total number of samples in observation (12x6)	72

Based on the above criteria, 72 palm oil companies were selected as samples.

3.3. Technique Data analysis

The data analysis technique used in this study is Multiple Linear Regression which aims to determine the direction of the relationship between the independent variables and the dependent variable whether each independent variable is positively or negatively related and to predict the value of the dependent variable if the value of the independent variable increases or decreases. The regression equation can be written as follows:

$$Y_{it} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X1_{it} + \beta_2 X2_{it} + \beta_3 X3_{it} + \beta_4 X4_{it} + \varepsilon_{it}$$

Information:

Y : Audit Quality

β_0 : Intercept

β_i : Regression coefficient ($i= 1,2,3,4$)

$X1$: Audit Committee Activities

$X2$: Independence of the Audit Committee

$X3$: Audit Committee Competencies

$X4$: Women's Audit Committee

i : Cross section (Company)

t : Time series (2018 – 2023)

4. RESEARCH RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

4.1. Research result

1) Descriptive Statistical Test

Descriptive statistics describe the sample data used in this study to determine the maximum value, minimum value, average value (mean) and standard deviation of each variable, namely audit committee activity, audit committee independence, audit committee competence, the presence of female audit committees, and audit quality. The maximum value is the highest value of several data analyzed in a certain period. The minimum value is the lowest value of the amount of data analyzed in a certain period. The average (mean) is the average of several data analyzed in certain data. Standard deviation to show the results of data variations analyzed in a certain period. The higher the standard deviation of a variable, the more the data in the variable is spread from the average value (mean) and if the standard deviation of a variable is lower, the data in the variable shows an average value that is not evenly distributed.

Table 2 shows the results of descriptive statistical processing. Conducting descriptive statistical tests to provide an overview or description of the data used in the study. In this study, the variables used are audit committee activity, audit committee independence, audit committee competence, the presence of female audit committees, and audit quality..

Table 2. Descriptive Statistics

Variables	N	Minimum	Maximum	Average	Standard Deviation
Train Activity (X1)	72	2	14	6.1528	2.59284
KA Independence (X2)	72	0.33	0.75	0.633	0.10459
KA Competence (X3)	72	0.33	1	0.8251	0.20869
Female Train (X4)	72	0.00	1	0.0929	0.18507
Audit Quality (Y)	72	0.0015	0.5556	0.337758	0.2213839
Valid N (listwise)	72				

Source: Processed Data (2025).

Analysis of the descriptive statistical results, namely N, is the number of data processed in the core research, namely 72 data.

- a. The audit committee activity variable from the descriptive statistical analysis shows that the average value is 6.15. While the minimum value is 2, namely PT Mahkota Group Tbk in 2018 and the maximum is 14, namely PT Sawit Sumbermas Sarana Tbk in 2023. While the standard deviation is 2.59. The standard deviation value of the audit committee activity variable is smaller than the average value, so it can be interpreted that the audit committee activity has a low level of data variation.
- b. The audit committee independence variable from the descriptive statistical analysis shows that the average value is 0.63. While the minimum value is 0.3 and the maximum value is 0.67. While the standard deviation is 0.1. The standard deviation value of the audit committee independence variable is smaller than the average value, so it can be interpreted that the audit committee independence has a low level of data variation.
- c. The audit committee competency variable from the descriptive statistical analysis shows that the average value is 0.825. While the minimum value is 0.33 at PT Austindo Nusantara Jaya Tbk and the maximum is 1.00 in 8 sample companies. While the standard deviation is 0.2. The standard deviation value of the audit committee competency variable is smaller than its average value, so it can be interpreted that the audit committee competency has a low level of data variation.
- d. The variable of the existence of female audit committees from the results of this descriptive statistical analysis shows that the average value is 0.09. While the minimum and maximum values are 0.00 and 1.00. While the standard deviation is 0.185. The standard deviation value of the variable of the existence of female audit committees is greater than the average value, so it can be interpreted that the existence of female audit committees has a high level of data variation.
- e. The audit quality variable results from this descriptive statistical analysis show that the average value is 0.34. While the minimum and maximum values are 0.0015 and 0.55. While the standard deviation is 0.22. The standard deviation value of the audit quality variable is smaller than its average value, so it can be interpreted that audit quality has a low level of data variation.

2) Multiple Linear Regression Analysis

To see how much influence the independent variable has (audit committee activities, audit committee independence, audit committee competence, and the presence of female audit committee members) on the dependent variable (audit quality) then multiple linear regression analysis is performed. After the data is processed using SPSS, the regression results table is obtained as follows:

Table 3. Results of Multiple Linear Regression Analysis

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized	t	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Coefficients Beta		
(Constant)	0.635	0.198		3.206	0.002
Train Activity (X1)	0.023	0.010	0.272	2.284	0.026
KA Independence (X2)	-0.480	0.245	-0.227	-1.959	0.054
KA Competence (X3)	-0.178	0.120	-0.168	-1.492	0.140
Female Train (X4)	0.124	0.141	0.104	0.876	0.384

Source: Processed Data (2024)

Based on table 3, the following regression equation is obtained:

$$Y = 0.635 + 0.023X1 - 0.480X2 - 0.178X3 + 0.124X4$$

Based on the equation above, it can be explained as follows:

a. $\alpha = 0.635$

If variables X1, X2, X3 and X4 are zero, then the value of variable Y is a constant of 0.635.

b. $\beta_1 = 0.023$

The regression coefficient of 0.023 for audit committee activity (X1) indicates that every one unit increase in the audit committee activity variable will increase audit quality by 0.023 units, assuming the variables of audit committee independence, audit committee competence, and the presence of female audit committee members remain constant.

c. $\beta_2 = -0.480$

The regression coefficient of -0.480 for audit committee independence (X2) shows that every one unit increase in the audit committee independence variable will decrease audit quality by -0.480 units, assuming the variables of audit committee activity, audit committee competence, and the presence of female audit committee members remain constant.

d. $B_3 = -0.178$

The regression coefficient of -0.178 for audit committee competence (X3) shows that every one unit increase in the audit committee competence variable will decrease audit quality by -0.178 units, assuming the variables of audit committee activity, audit committee independence, and the presence of female audit committee members remain constant.

e. $B_4 = 0.124$

The regression coefficient of 0.124 for the female audit committee (X4) indicates that every one unit increase in the female audit committee variable will increase audit quality by 0.124 units, assuming the audit committee activity, audit committee independence and audit committee competence variables remain constant.

3) Hypothesis Testing

There are 3 tests carried out in this hypothesis test, namely:

a. **Simultaneous Test (F Test)**

F-test or model fit test used in assessing the feasibility of the regression model that has been formed. This test is also used to conduct a hypothesis test of the regression coefficient simultaneously. The following are the results of the model fit test in this study:

Table 4. F Test

		ANOVA				
Model		Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	,599	4	,150	3,484	,012b
	Residual	2,881	67	,043		
	Total	3,480	71			

Source: Data processed by researchers 2025

Based on the table, it can be seen that the significance figure p is ≤ 0.05 , which indicates that the multiple linear regression equation model formed is appropriate for further testing.

b. **Coefficient of Determination Test (*AdjustedR2*)**

The determination coefficient test is one of the tests that aims to measure the extent to which the independent variable explains the variation of the dependent variable. The test results in this study can be seen in table 5 as follows:

Table 5. Results of the Determination Coefficient Test

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square
1	,415a	,172	,123

Source: Data processed by researchers 2025

Based on the Model Summary table above, it is known that the coefficient of determination or R square is 0.172 or equal to 17.2%. This can be interpreted that the independent variables contained in this study are able to explain the factors that influence audit quality 17.2%, and the remaining 82.8% is influenced by other variables outside this study.

c. TestPartial(t-test)

The t-test is used to determine whether the independent variables (audit committee activity, audit committee independence, audit committee competence, and the presence of female audit committee members) individually or partially affect the dependent variable (audit quality) in the linear regression model. The significance level of the partial parameter test (t-test) is less than 0.05. The following are the results of the t-test in this study:

Table 6. t-test

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
(Constant)	,635	,198		3,206	,002
Train Activity (X1)	,023	,010	,272	2,284	,026
KA Independence (X2)	-,480	,245	-,227	-1,959	,054
KA Competence (X3)	-,178	,120	-,168	-1,492	,140
Female Train (X4)	,124	,141	,104	,876	,384

Source: Data processed by researchers 2025

The results of the t-test above can be explained as follows:

(1) Audit Committee Activities

The audit committee activity variable (X1) has a coefficient of 0.272 with a significance level of less than 0.05, so it can be concluded that the audit committee activity variable (X1) has a positive and significant effect on audit quality, so H1 is accepted.

(2) Independence of the Audit Committee

The audit committee independence variable (X2) has a coefficient of -0.227 with a significance level above 0.05, so it can be concluded that the audit committee independence variable (X2) does not have a significant effect on audit quality, so H2 is rejected.

(3) Competence Audit Committee

The audit committee competency variable (X3) has a coefficient of -0.168 with a significance level above 0.05, so it can be concluded that the audit committee competency variable (X3) does not have a significant effect on audit quality, so H3 is rejected.

(4) Committee Women's Audit

The variable of the existence of a female audit committee (X4) has a coefficient of 0.104 with a significance level above 0.05 so it can be concluded that the variable of the existence of a female audit committee (X4) does not have a significant effect on audit quality, so H4 is rejected.

4.2. Discussion of Research Results

1) The influence of audit committee activities on audit quality

The results of the study indicate that audit committee activities have a positive and significant effect on audit quality. The frequency of meetings held by the audit committee can increase supervision of the audit process and ensure that auditors carry out their duties independently and objectively, encouraging auditors to carry out audits more

carefully and produce quality audits. The results of this study are in line with the results of research by Hartantya & Muslimin (2024) which show that the higher the frequency of audit committee meetings, the more effective it is in monitoring the company and improving audit quality. The results of research by Triyanto and Putri (2023), Akhbar and Sebrina (2024) state that companies that frequently hold audit committee meetings every year are more optimal in monitoring company management so that they will be more effective in producing quality audits. The findings of this study confirm that the audit committee, as a crucial component in the company structure, has a very important role in improving audit standards. As part of the supervisory structure under the board of commissioners, this committee is responsible for providing recommendations to the board of commissioners regarding the appointment of public accountants, supporting auditor independence and overseeing the audit process by paying attention to compliance with applicable standards and policies.

However, the results of this study reject the research results from (Riswandi et al, 2024); (Handayani & Setiawan, 2024); (Effendi & Ulhaq, 2023) which shows that the activity audit committee has no significant effect on audit quality. The results of the study indicate that the audit committee's activities are not effective in monitoring and improving audit quality. The results of this study indicate that the audit committee only carries out its duties to monitor and monitor management actions as an effort to assist the duties and functions of the board of commissioners. Therefore, the activities carried out by the audit committee do not affect audit quality, because they are only to fulfill their responsibilities as supervisors and monitors of management performance. It was also stated that the existence of an audit committee may only fulfill regulations issued by the Capital Market Supervisory Agency (Bapepam) or the Financial Services Authority (OJK), without having a significant impact on improving audit quality.

2) The effect of audit committee independence on audit quality

The results of the study indicate that audit committee independence does not affect audit quality. Audit committee independence cannot affect external audit performance if the audit committee does not have adequate knowledge of the company's operations, experience related to the field and reliance on information provided by external auditors in their audit reports. In line with research conducted by Aridi and Agustina (2020) which shows that audit committee independence does not affect audit quality because the supervisory function of the external auditor's performance carried out by the audit committee in the company is not optimal. In An's (2023) study which states that audit committee independence does not affect audit quality, the study shows that the appointment of audit committee members is greatly influenced by family owners or controlling shareholders, when audit committee members do not have financial or personal relationships with the company being audited, the audit committee can carry out supervision more objectively and free from conflicts of interest.

The results of the study reject the results of Ritonga's (2022) study which shows that audit committee independence has a positive effect on audit quality and Saif et al (2024) shows that independence plays a more important role in ensuring high-quality audits. Khudhair et al's (2019) study states that audit committee independence is very important to ensure the integrity of the financial reporting process. This shows that non-executive audit committee members tend to be more effective in overseeing the audited financial statements.

3) The influence of audit committee competence on audit quality

The results of the study indicate that the competence of the audit committee does not have a significant effect on audit quality. This is due to several reasons. First, although the audit committee has high competence, if it is not supported by independence and integrity, their ability to carry out effective supervision can be compromised. Second, technical competence must be balanced with a critical attitude and the courage to question management and auditor decisions. Without these qualities, technical competence alone will not help much in identifying and preventing errors or fraud in financial statements. Third, collaboration and communication between the audit committee, auditors, and management also play an important role in determining audit quality. Therefore, although the competence of the audit committee is an important aspect, the study shows that the competence of the audit committee does not significantly affect audit quality if it is not supported by other equally important factors.

The results of this study reject the theory of malignancy *agency theory*, who argues that audit committee competence is a major factor in improving audit quality. Agency theory states that a competent audit committee can reduce agency problems by monitoring management more effectively and ensuring accurate financial reporting. (An,

2023).The results of this study are also inconsistent with Dewi & Eriandani (2022) who stated that accounting expertise on the audit committee has a positive influence on audit quality because the expertise of the audit committee can encourage external auditors to expand the scope of the audit, then Sharhan & Bora (2020) who stated that the expertise of the audit committee can affect audit quality.

The results of this study indicate that although audit committee competence is important, it does not significantly affect audit quality if it is not supported by other factors such as independence, integrity, critical attitude, and effective communication. Thus, this study challenges the basic assumption of the keganen theory regarding the main role of audit committee competence in determining audit quality, and shows that audit quality is influenced by a combination of factors that work synergistically. In line with the research of Simanullang and Utami (2021) which found that audit committee expertise does not affect audit quality because there is a possibility that auditors feel less free to carry out their duties, if the supervision carried out is too tight. Auditors will feel that clients do not trust the auditor's ability to conduct audits so that auditors will work under pressure. Apriyani and Achyani's (2023) research found that audit committee expertise does not affect audit quality because the expertise of audit committee members in accounting and finance alone is not enough to carry out their functions and responsibilities in supervising the company but is also influenced by the level of formal academic education possessed by audit committee members that is in accordance with the type of industry of the company.

4) The influence of female audit committee on audit quality

The results of the study show that the presence of female audit committees does not have a significant effect on audit quality. This shows that the presence of women in the audit committee cannot affect the audit quality of external auditors. This is in line with research Alhababsah & Yekini (2021), research shows that gender is considered less relevant when compared to the technical abilities and professional experience of audit committee members, Corporate governance often shows that the contribution of female members can be limited in certain environments, especially if the organizational structure or corporate culture does not support a significant influence of gender diversity. The results of Dewi & Eriandani's (2022) study also showed that the presence of women on the audit committee did not affect audit quality as proxied by audit fees. This also indicates that there is no difference between men and women in audit quality. Azizkhani et al.'s (2023) study did not find a significant effect between the gender of the audit committee chair and the selection of Big 4 auditors, audit fees, and audit quality. These results support the conclusion of Gozali et al. (2023) which states that the gender of the audit committee does not significantly affect audit quality.

In contrast to Hardies et al (2015) research, it was stated that in the process of selecting an audit committee, companies pay attention to gender. There are many requests or encouragements in companies to recruit female audit committees. Female audit committees can provide direct benefits to companies in terms of improving audit quality. In An's research,(2023)shows that a more diverse audit committee, including the involvement of women, can provide broader views and improve the dynamics of discussions, the presence of women on the audit committee itself is enough to significantly improve audit quality. Lai et al.'s (2017) study found that the presence of women on the audit committee can encourage the selection of industry specialist auditors and tend to pay higher audit fees as an indication of the audit committee's commitment to obtaining high-quality audits.

5. CONCLUSION AND LIMITATIONS

5.1. Conclusion

This study aims to determine the effect of audit committee activities, audit committee independence, audit committee competence and the presence of female audit committees. The objects of this research are palm oil plantation companies listed on the IDX with an observation period of 6 consecutive years from 2018 to 2023. This study uses 72 samples with 12 companies using SPSS version 26. Based on the research objectives, problem formulation, and hypothesis testing carried out, the conclusions include:

- 1) Audit committee activity has a positive and significant effect on audit quality. This indicates that a more active audit committee supervises the audit process and ensures that auditors carry out their duties independently and objectively, encouraging auditors to carry out audits more carefully and produce quality audits.

- 2) Audit committee independence does not affect audit quality. This shows that audit committee independence cannot affect the quality of audits produced by external audits. Supervision related to audit results carried out by an independent audit committee if not balanced with competence and experience related to the related field to supervise external audit performance to produce quality audit reports.
- 3) Audit committee competence does not affect audit quality. This shows that audit committee competence cannot affect the audit quality of external auditors. Auditors in carrying out their audits must remain in accordance with procedures and must improve their audit quality so that the audited financial statements can reflect the true value.
- 4) The existence of a female audit committee does not affect audit quality. This shows that the presence of women in the audit committee does not affect the audit quality of external auditors. External auditors in conducting the audit process are not influenced by the gender of the audit committee in carrying out the supervisory function and the audit results made by external auditors.

5.2. Limitations

This study has several limitations that need to be considered in interpreting the results.

- 1) The scope of this study is limited to the influence of audit committee activities, audit committee independence, audit committee competence, and the presence of female audit committee members on audit quality, so that other factors that may influence audit quality are not explored.
- 2) This study only covers palm oil companies listed on the Indonesia Stock Exchange (IDX) during the period 2018-2023, which means the results may not be generalizable to other industry sectors or different time periods.
- 3) The use of data from palm oil companies listed on the IDX can limit variations in company characteristics, such as size, complexity, and regulation that can affect research results.
- 4) This study uses independent variables that may not fully reflect all important aspects of the audit committee that contribute to audit quality.

Therefore, the results of this study need to be viewed in the context of these limitations, and further research is recommended to expand the scope and population so that the results are more comprehensive and applicable.

REFERENCES

- Abbasi, K., Alam, A., & Bhuiyan, M. B. U. (2020). Audit committees, female directors and the types of female and male financial experts: Further evidence. *Journal of Business Research*, 114, 186–197. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2020.04.013>
- Akhbar, R. A., & Sebrina, N. (2024). Pengaruh Audit Firm Rotation, Komite Audit, dan Audit Capacity Terhadap Kualitas Audit: Studi Empiris pada Perusahaan Sub Sektor Bank yang Terdaftar di BEI Periode 2018-2022. *Jurnal Eksplorasi Akuntansi (JEA)*, 6(3), 932-945. <https://doi.org/10.24036/jea.v6i3.1558>
- Alhababsah, S., & Yekini, S. (2021). Audit Committee and Audit Quality: An Empirica; Analysis Considering Industry Expertise, Legal Expertise and Gender Diversity. *Journal of International Accounting, Auditing and Taxation*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intaccaudtax.2021.100377>
- Amr. (2003). KAP Hans Tuanakotta Akan Diadukan ke Bapepam. Diakses Pada 12 Januari 2024 dari <https://www.hukumonline.com/berita/a/kap-hans-tuanakotta-akan-diadukan-ke-bapepam-hol8249/?page=all>
- An, Y. (2023). Does Quality of Audit Committee Enhance Audit Quality? *International Journal of Professional Business Review*, 8(2), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.26668/businessreview/2023.v8i2.1385>
- Apriyani, D. D., & Achyani, F. (2021). Pengaruh Keahlian Komite Audit, Independensi, Dan Client Importance Terhadap Kualitas Audit Dengan Fee Audit Sebagai Variabel Moderasi (Studi Empiris pada Perusahaan Sektor Infrastruktur, Utilitas dan Transportasi yang Terdaftar di Bursa Efek Indonesia Tahun 2017-2021). *Management Studies and Entrepreneurship Journal*, 4(6), 8739-8752.
- Aridi, K. A., & Agustina, Y. (2020). Pengaruh Independensi Komite Audit, Audit Tenure dan Reputasi Auditor Terhadap Kualitas Audit Pada Perusahaan Sektor Perdagangan Eceran Yang Terdaftar di Bursa Efek Indonesia (BEI) Tahun 2011-2018. *Jurnal Ekonomi & Bisnis*, 18(2), 109-118. <http://dx.doi.org/10.32722/eb.v18i2.2491>
- Astuti, D. D., Surbakti, L. P., & Wijayanti, A. (2021). Pengaruh Independensi dan Keahlian Komite Audit Terhadap Manajemen Laba Riil dengan Kualitas Audit Sebagai Variabel Moderasi. *Jurnal Akuntansi, Keuangan, dan Manajemen (Jakman)*, 2(4), 345-358. <https://doi.org/10.35912/jakman.v2i4.564>

- Azizkhani, M., Hossain, S., & Nguyen, M. (2023). Effects of audit committee chair characteristics on auditor choice, audit fee and audit quality. *Accounting and Finance*, 63(3), 3675–3707. <https://doi.org/10.1111/acfi.13058>
- Chandrarin, Grahita. 2017. Metode Riset Akuntansi Pendekatan Kuantitatif. Edisi 3. Salemba Empat. Jakarta.
- Cho, M., Ki, E., & Kwon, S. Y. (2017). The effects of accruals quality on audit hours and audit fees. *Journal of Accounting, Auditing and Finance*, 32(3), 372–400. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0148558X15611323>
- CNBC Indonesia. (2020). Laporan Keuangan Asabri, 8 Tahun Empat Kali di-Restatement. Diakses Pada 12 Januari 2024 dari <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/market/20200114180834-17-130006/laporan-keuangan-asabri-8-tahun-empat-kali-di-restatement>
- Dubaere, Charlotte. 2008. Concentration on the Audit Market. *Disertasi*. Ghent: Ghent University.
- DeAngelo. (1981). Auditor Size and Audit Quality. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 3. 183-199.
- Dewi, Shinta Ratna & Eriandani, Rizky. (2022). Karakteristik Komite Audit dan Kualitas Audit. *Jurnal Studi Akuntansi dan Keuangan*, 5(1), 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.29303/akurasi.v5i1.125>
- Ditjenbun. (2022). Kontribusi Minyak Kelapa Sawit Indonesia Mengatasi Krisis Pangan Global. Kemetrian Pertanian Direktorat Jenderal Pertanian. Diakses Pada 12 Januari 2024 dari <https://ditjenbun.pertanian.go.id/kontribusi-minyak-kelapa-sawit-indonesia-mengatasi-krisis-pangan-global/>
- Gozali, E. O. D., Hamzah, R. S., & Listya, A. (2023). Menilai Audit Firm Rotation, Gender Komite Audit, Struktur Kepemilikan, Audit Fee Dan Kualitas Audit – Studi Kasus Pada Industri Perbankan Indonesia. *Owner: Riset & Jurnal Akuntansi*, 7(2), 1149–1163. <https://doi.org/10.33395/owner.v7i2.1426>
- Effendi, E., & Ulhaq, R. D. (2023). Pengaruh Audittenure, Reputasi Auditor, Ukuran Perusahaan Dan Komite Audit Terhadap Kualitas Audit (Studi Empiris pada Perusahaan Pertambangan yang terdaftar di Bursa Efek Indonesia Tahun 2015-2018). *Jurnal Ilmiah MEA (Manajemen, Ekonomi, Dan Akuntansi)*, 5, 1457–1504.
- Handayani, P., & Setiawan, M. A. (2024). Pengaruh Auditor Switching, Komite Audit, dan Audit Capacity Stress terhadap Kualitas Audit. *JEA Jurnal Eksplorasi Akuntansi (JEA)*, 6(2), 458–471. <http://jea.ppj.unp.ac.id/index.php/jea/index>
- Hardies, K., Breesch, D., & Branson, J. (2015). The Female Audit Fee Premium. *Auditing: A Journal of Practice & Theory*, 34(4), 171–195. <https://doi.org/10.2308/ajpt-51079>
- Hartantya, E. K., & Muslimin. (2024). Pengaruh Reputasi Auditor, Rotasi Auditor, dan Komite Audit Terhadap Kualitas Audit (Studi Empiris Pada Perusahaan Manufaktur Subsektor Industri Food And Beverage Yang Terdaftar di BEI Tahun 2019-2022). *COSTING: Journal of Economic, Business and Accounting*, 7(5). <https://doi.org/10.31539/costing.v7i5.10028>
- Hermawan, A., & Damayanti, D. R. (2018). *Kualitas Audit dan Manajemen Laba*. Bandung:Adhi Sarana Nusantara.
- Indella, D. R., & Husaini. (2016). Efektivitas Komite Audit, Kualitas Auditor Eksternal dan Kemungkinan Kecurangan Pelaporan Keuangan. *Jurnal Fairness*, 6(3), 201-218.
- Jensen, M. C., & William H. Meckling. (1976). Theory of The Firm: Managerial Behavior, Agency Costs and Ownership Structure. *Journal of Financial Economics*. 305-360.
- Khudhair, D.Z., Al-Zhubaidi, F. K. A., & Raji, A. A. (2019). The Effect of Board Characteristics and Audit Committee Characteristics on Audit Quality. *Management Science Letters*, 9(2), 271-282. <https://doi.org/10.5267/j.msl.2018.11.012>
- Kementerian Keuangan Republik Indonesia Badan Pengawas Pasar Modal dan Lembaga Keuangan Nomor: KEP-643/BL/2012 Tentang Pembentukan dan Pedoman Pelaksanaan Kerja Komite Audit.
- Kencana, Rizki Wastu. (2015). Kasus Kimia Farma (Etika Bisnis). Diakses Pada 12 Januari 2024 dari https://www.kompasiana.com/www.bobotoh_pas20.com/5535b4d46ea8349b26da42eb/kasus-kimia-farma-etika-bisnis
- Klein, April. (2002). Audit Committee, Board of Director Characteristics, and Earnings Management. *Journal of Accounting and Economics*. 275-400. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0165-4101\(02\)00059-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0165-4101(02)00059-9)
- Lai, K. M. Y., Srinidhi, B., Gul, F. A., & Tsui, J. (2017). Board Gender Diversity, Auditor Fees, and Auditor Choice. *Contemporary Accounting Research*, 34(3), 1681–1714. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1111/1911-3846.12313>
- Mandiontong, Mathius. (2015). *Kualitas Audit dan Pengukurannya*. Bandung:Alfabeta.
- Mustafa, A., Saeed, A., Awais, M., & Aziz, S. (2020). Board-Gender Diversity, Family Ownership, and Dividend Announcement: Evidence from Asian Emerging Economies. *Journal of Risk and Financial Management*, 13(4).

<https://doi.org/10.3390/jrfm13040062>

- Pratiwi, Hesti Rika. (2019). Kronologi Kisruh Laporan Keuangan Garuda Indonesia. Diakses Pada 12 Januari 2024 dari <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/market/20200114164901-17-129978/terungkap-bpk-sebut-asabri-investasi-pada-saham-tak-likuid>
- Riswandi, Padi., Yuniarti, Rina., & Subandrio (2024). Pengaruh Komite Audit Dan Fee Audit Terhadap Kualitas Audit Pada Perusahaan BUMN di Indonesia. *Jurnal Akuntansi dan Teknologi Informasi Akuntansi*, 5(13), 216–233. <https://doi.org/10.36085/jakta.v5i1.6526>
- Ritonga, P (2022). Pengaruh Csr Dan Komite Audit Terhadap Kualitas Audit Dan Implikasinya Terhadap Penghindaran Pajak. *Jurnal Ilmu Akuntansi ULTIMA Accounting*, 14(1). <https://doi.org/10.31937/akuntansi.v14i1.2526>
- Saif, G. H. S., Triyono., & Bawono, A. D. B (2024). Effects of Audit Committee Independence, Effectiveness on Audit Quality: Evidence from Yemen. *Global Journal of Research in Business Management*, 4(2). <http://dx.doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.10854647>
- Sharhan, A. A. M., & Bora, C. (2020). Effect of Audit Committee characteristics on Audit Quality : A Critical Literature Review. *Journal of Advanced Research in Economics and Administrative Sciences*, 1(1), 1–12.
- Shofa, J. N. (2023). Indonesia's Palm Oil Export to China, Bangladesh on Rise. *Jakarta Globe*, 1. Diakses pada 12 Januari 2024 dari <https://jakartaglobe.id/business/indonesias-palm-oil-export-to-china-bangladesh-on-rise>
- Sidik, Syahrizal. (2019). Jiwasraya Belum Juga Rilis Lapkeu 2018, Kenapa?. Diakses Pada 12 Januari 2024 dari <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/market/20191227201418-17-126204/jiwasraya-belum-juga-rilis-lapkeu-2018-kenapa>
- Simanullang, R., & Utami, N.P. (2021).Pengaruh Keahlian Komite Audit, Fee Audit dan Audit Tenure Terhadap Kualitas Audit (Pada Perusahaan Manufaktur Sektor Industri Dasar dan Kimia yang Terdaftar di Bursa Efek Indonesia Tahun 2018-2020). *Jurnal Kewirausahaan, Akuntansi dan Manajemen TRI BISNIS*, 3(2), 229-245. <https://doi.org/10.59806/tribisnis.v3i2.45>
- Triyanto, D. N., & Putri, R. (2023). Pengaruh Beban Kerja, Pergantian Auditor, Rapat Komite Audit dan Spesialisasi Auditor Terhadap Kualitas Audit. *Jurnal Akuntansi Manado (JAIM)*, 4(2), 278–288. <https://doi.org/10.53682/jaim.vi.6823>
- Wahid, A. S. (2018). The Effects and the Mechanisms of Board Gender Diversity: Evidence from Financial Manipulation. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 159(3), 705–725. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-018-3785-6>
- Wahyudi, S. (2012). Kasus Enron dan Akibatnya. Diakses Pada 12 Januari 2024 dari https://mahasiswa.ung.ac.id/921411043/home/2012/10/12/kasus_enron_dan_akibatnya.html
- Wareza, Monica. (2020). Terungkap! BPK Sebut Asabri Investasi pada Saham Tak Likuid. Diakses Pada 12 Januari 2024 dari <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/market/20200114164901-17-129978/terungkap-bpk-sebut-asabri-investasi-pada-saham-tak-likuid>